



May 20, 2020

Attn: Mr. Don Chamblee, PE
Public Works Director
Lincoln County
115 W. Main Street
Lincolnton, NC 28092

**RE: Lincoln County, North Carolina
Killian Creek WWTP Ph 3 Upgrade
WKD Project Number #20170294.00.CL
Bid Tabulation and Recommendation**

Dear Mr. Chamblee:

Enclosed is the Certified Bid Tabulation for the subject project. The three lowest bidders, listed in ascending order, are PC Construction Company, Lane Construction Corporation, and Wharton-Smith, Inc.

During our review of the seven bids that were submitted for the project, we found the following math errors:

- PC Construction Company, rounded Line Item 5.04, Contingency Allowance up to the nearest dollar, from \$1,426,857.50 to \$1,426,858.00.
- Lane Construction, rounded Line Item 5.04, Contingency Allowance up the nearest dollar, from \$1,454,018.85 to \$1,454,019.00.

The Certified Bid Tabulation reflects the corrected numbers.

Other comments based on our review of the bid documents received from the three lowest bidders are as follows:

- All three bidders included the Owner preferred alternate equipment items as their base bid except for the electric motor actuators. All three bidders listed AUMA actuators as their base bid, offering a deduct averaging \$60,000.
- All three bidders acknowledged receipt of all five (5) addenda.

- There were no irregularities in the Statement of Qualifications submitted by any of the three lowest bidders. All provided substantial evidence of their qualifications to perform the work of the project.
- PC Construction, Lane and Wharton-Smith all provided the Good Faith Efforts Form earning greater than 50 points and identification of minority business participation with none meeting the 10% MBE/WBE goal for the project.

Since we have no recent experience with the work of PC Construction Company, we reviewed the Statement of Qualifications provided as part of the bid package required by the Contract documents. The Statement of Qualifications required examples of similar experience, references, safety records, etc.

The majority of the current and similar projects provided in PC Construction Company's Statement of Qualifications were plant projects located in the eastern United States. The company is headquartered in Vermont. We focused our reference research to similar projects in size and scope and located in the southeast. We contacted several references that were provided in the Statement of Qualifications. A detailed summary of feedback received is attached for your reference. In summary, the feedback was positive.

After contacting their references, reviewing their safety records, gaining an understanding of their knowledge of their experience with a project of this nature, review of their Statement of Qualifications, and their reputation throughout the industry, we feel confident that they are prepared and capable to perform the work. We believe that PC Construction Company provided the lowest responsive bid in the amount of \$29,964,007.50. This price does not include an additional \$57,000 for providing the Owner Preferred EIM electric motor actuators. Upon consulting with Lincoln County staff, it is agreed and recommended to utilize the contractors base bid equipment manufacturer, AUMA, for the electric motor actuators and forgo the additional cost.

Before proceeding we recommend that Lincoln County review the bid package provided by PC Construction Company thoroughly for consideration of selection for this project.

Mr. Chamblee
May 20, 2020
Page 3

We appreciate the opportunity to provide this service for Lincoln County, and we are available to answer any questions you may have.

Sincerely,

W. K. Dickson & Co., Inc.



Ryan W. Hager, P.E.
Project Manager

RWH:aeH

Enclosures: Tabulations of all bids received (sealed by engineer)
 Summary of References

BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
KILLIAN CREEK WWTP DESIGN 3 CONSTRUCTION
BID DATE: MAY 12,2020 @ 2:00 PM

				1		2		3	
				PC Construction Company 193 Tilley Drive South Burlington, VT 05403 License No. 6142		Lane Construction Corp. 3010 Royal Blvd. S., Ste. 125 Alpharetta, GA 30022 License No. 6205		Wharton-Smith, Inc. 750 Monroe Road Sanford, FL 32771 License No. 38755	
Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price
	Killian Creek								
5.01	Lump Sum Bid Price for Base Bid	1	LS	27,578,900.00	\$ 27,578,900.00	28,411,977.00	\$ 28,411,977.00	30,027,000.00	\$ 30,027,000.00
5.02	Unit Cost Items								
	1. Excavation and Offsite Disposal of Rock Material	5000	CY	109.00	\$ 545,000.00	85.00	\$ 425,000.00	155.00	\$ 775,000.00
	2. Excavation and Offsite Disposal of Trench Rock Material	500	CY	163.00	\$ 81,500.00	115.00	\$ 57,500.00	215.00	\$ 107,500.00
	3. Removal and Disposal of Grit Material Accumulations within Existing SBR Basins	550	TONS	467.00	\$ 256,850.00	150.00	\$ 82,500.00	290.00	\$ 159,500.00
	4. Full Depth Pavement Repair	500	SY	49.00	\$ 24,500.00	106.00	\$ 53,000.00	50.00	\$ 25,000.00
	5. Additional Asphalt Overlay	4200	SY	12.00	\$ 50,400.00	12.00	\$ 50,400.00	15.00	\$ 63,000.00
5.03	Subtotal: Base Bid (Lump Sum and Unit Cost Items):								
					\$ 28,537,150.00		\$ 29,080,377.00		\$ 31,157,000.00
5.04	Contingency Allowance @ 5% of Subtotal				\$ 1,426,857.50		\$ 1,454,018.85		\$ 1,557,850.00
	Total Base Bid (Lump Sum, Unit Cost Items and Contingency Allowance)				\$ 29,964,007.50		\$ 30,534,395.85		\$ 32,714,850.00
Spec	Schedule A. Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products	Preferred Manufacturer		Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product	Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product	Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product
26 45 00	SCADA System Modifications	Dorsett			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
40 92 13.13	Electric Motor Actuators	EIM		AUMA	\$ 57,000.00	Not Listed	\$ 75,000.00	AUMA	\$ 50,000.00
43 12 19	Positive Displacement Blower Assemblies	Excelsior			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 13	Centrifugal Chemical Pumps	Finish Thompson			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 36	Rotary Lobe Pumps	Borger			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 39	Submersible Pumps in SBR, Digester, and Sludge Holding, Exclusive of Jet Aeration Pumps	Wilo			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 39	Submersible Pumps in Post Equalization Basin	Xylem, Flygt			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 32 63	Ultraviolet (UV) Disinfection Equipment	Xylem, Wedeco			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
44 42 39	Preliminary Treatment Equipment	Lakeside Equip. Corp.			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
44 46 10	SBR & Digester Equipment Including Jet Aeration Pumps	Evoqua			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
44 46 16	Rotary Sludge Press Equipment & Conveyors	Fournier			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
46 33 33	Polymer Blending & Feed Equipment	Excell Feeders, Inc.			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
46 41 23	Submersible Mixers in Post Equalization Basin	Xylem, Flygt			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
46 61 46	Automatic Backwash Disc Filter Equipment	Kruger			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
	Subtotal: Schedule A-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products (Addition/Deduct)				\$ 57,000.00		\$ 75,000.00		\$ 50,000.00
	Total Bid: Base Bid (Lump Sum, Unit Costs Items and Contingency Allowance and Schedule A-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products)				\$ 30,021,007.50		\$ 30,609,395.85		\$ 32,764,850.00

BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
KILLIAN CREEK WWTP DESIGN 3 CONSTRUCTION
BID DATE: MAY 12,2020 @ 2:00 PM

4						5		6		7	
				M. B. Kahn Construction Co., Inc. 101 Flintlake Road Columbia, SC 29223 License No. 1425		J. Cumby Construction Inc. 165 W. Broad Street Cookeville, TN 38501 License No. 82136		Harper Corporation 35 West Court Street, Ste. 400 Greenville, SC 29601-2817 License No. 3146		Adams Robinson Construction 2735 Needmore Road Dayton, OH 45414 License No. 29510	
Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price
	Killian Creek										
5.01	Lump Sum Bid Price for Base Bid	1	LS	31,867,000.00	\$ 31,867,000.00	32,660,000.00	\$ 32,660,000.00	33,492,303.00	\$ 33,492,303.00	36,110,600.00	\$ 36,110,600.00
5.02	Unit Cost Items										
	1. Excavation and Offsite Disposal of Rock Material	5000	CY	160.00	\$ 800,000.00	100.00	\$ 500,000.00	51.77	\$ 258,850.00	108.00	\$ 540,000.00
	2. Excavation and Offsite Disposal of Trench Rock Material	500	CY	215.00	\$ 107,500.00	125.00	\$ 62,500.00	97.23	\$ 48,615.00	150.00	\$ 75,000.00
	3. Removal and Disposal of Grit Material Accumulations within Existing SBR Basins	550	TONS	180.00	\$ 99,000.00	525.00	\$ 288,750.00	411.40	\$ 226,270.00	200.00	\$ 110,000.00
	4. Full Depth Pavement Repair	500	SY	60.00	\$ 30,000.00	50.00	\$ 25,000.00	50.82	\$ 25,410.00	50.00	\$ 25,000.00
	5. Additional Asphalt Overlay	4200	SY	15.00	\$ 63,000.00	12.00	\$ 50,400.00	11.56	\$ 48,552.00	12.00	\$ 50,400.00
5.03	Subtotal: Base Bid (Lump Sum and Unit Cost Items):										
					\$ 32,966,500.00		\$ 33,586,650.00		\$ 34,100,000.00		\$ 36,911,000.00
5.04	Contingency Allowance @ 5% of Subtotal				\$ 1,648,325.00		\$ 1,679,332.50		\$ 1,705,000.00		\$ 1,845,550.00
	Total Base Bid (Lump Sum, Unit Cost Items and Contingency Allowance)				\$ 34,614,825.00		\$ 35,265,982.50		\$ 35,805,000.00		\$ 38,756,550.00
Spec	Schedule A. Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products	Preferred Manufacturer	Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product		Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product	Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product	Equipment Base Bid Mnfr.	Add/Deduct to Base Bid for "Alternative Owner Preferred Equip. or Product
26 45 00	SCADA System Modifications	Dorsett		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -	Dorsett	\$ -
40 92 13.13	Electric Motor Actuators	EIM	AUMA	\$ 75,000.00			\$ -	AUMA	\$ 70,000.00	EIM	\$ 81,000.00
43 12 19	Positive Displacement Blower Assemblies	Excelsior	United Blowers	\$ 71,000.00		Excelsior	\$ 50,000.00		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 13	Centrifugal Chemical Pumps	Finish Thompson	Gould	\$ 50,000.00			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 36	Rotary Lobe Pumps	Borger		\$ -			\$ -	Vogelsang	\$ 75,000.00		\$ -
43 21 39	Submersible Pumps in SBR, Digester, and Sludge Holding, Exclusive of Jet Aeration Pumps	Wilo	Xylem	\$ 85,000.00			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 21 39	Submersible Pumps in Post Equalization Basin	Xylem, Flygt		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
43 32 63	Ultraviolet (UV) Disinfection Equipment	Xylem, Wedeco		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
44 42 39	Preliminary Treatment Equipment	Lakeside Equip. Corp.		\$ -			\$ -	Huber	\$ 30,000.00		\$ -
44 46 10	SBR & Digester Equipment Including Jet Aeration Pumps	Evoqua		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
44 46 16	Rotary Sludge Press Equipment & Conveyors	Fournier		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
46 33 33	Polymer Blending & Feed Equipment	Excell Feeders, Inc.		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
46 41 23	Submersible Mixers in Post Equalization Basin	Xylem, Flygt		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
46 61 46	Automatic Backwash Disc Filter Equipment	Kruger		\$ -			\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
	Subtotal: Schedule A-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products (Addition/Deduct)				\$ 281,000.00		\$ 50,000.00		\$ 175,000.00		\$ 81,000.00
	Total Bid: Base Bid (Lump Sum, Unit Costs Items and Contingency Allowance and Schedule A-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products)				\$ 34,895,825.00		\$ 35,315,982.50		\$ 35,980,000.00		\$ 38,837,550.00

To the best of my knowledge, I hereby certify that the above is a true and correct tabulation of bids received on May 12, 2020.



Ryan W. Hager, PE
Project Manager
W.K. Dickson & Co., Inc.
NC-License F-0374

**PC Construction Reference Contacts
for Killian Creek WWTP Phase 3 Upgrade**

Project: Brunswick WTP Phase I, Brunswick, ME (\$18,000,000)

Contact: Lyon Wadsworth, Wright-Pierce, Project Manager

- Project was a CM @ Risk project.
- PC Construction's work was a higher quality than normally encountered.
- Project was "professionally managed" by PC.
- OK with Change Orders and PC worked with subs to get best cost and did some on a time and expense basis.
- Consider PC to be a "top tier" contractor working on a different level than normal contractors.
- Their RFI often provided a recommended approach to issues.

Project: Lynchburg Wastewater Treatment Plant CSO Reduction Improvements, \$39,800,000

Contact: Eric Schrader, PE, City of Lynchburg, 434.455.4089

- Project was CM @ Risk.
- Overall project was very good.
- Schedule was pushing but very close.
- Project has extended over 4 years and experienced significant turnover for both PC Construction and subcontractors.
- Change Orders have been reasonable and PC's role has been an estimate value and negotiate with subcontractors.
- Would have no issues with PC on another project.

Project: Neuse River Wastewater Treatment Plant Expansion Phase 4 (\$25,900,000)

Contact: Ed Stempien, City of Raleigh 919.996.3490

- City of Raleigh's policy is not to comment on projects. It is, however noted that PC Construction lists the City of Raleigh Neuse River WWTP Phase 3 and a WWTP filter rehabilitation project listed reflecting multiple contracts.

**Project: Neuse River Wastewater Treatment Plant Expansion Phase 2 and Phase 3 Projects (P3-
\$27,000,000)**

Contact: Shannon Dorsey, Hazen & Sawyer (919.349.5999), Construction Manager

- Concrete work performed by PC personnel was great.
- Biggest challenge was toward end of project in project closeout and getting punch list completed. Had to push to get complete. Suggest maintaining enough in retainage to contractor priority.
- Would work with PC again. Work was generally above that of other contractors.
- Was generally able to compromise on Changed Orders. PC was a little

aggressive on initial CO's but was willing to sit down and work through costs with a give and take without significant problems.

- PC has a lot of resources and was able to pull from other projects in region as needed.
- One issue was getting PC to provide a realistic schedule. They have a tendency to project too optimistically. He had rather they be up front and provide more realistic schedule.
- Be mindful of retainage until work is done.

Project: Daytona Beach, FL Westside Regional Wastewater Reclamation Facility Improvements (\$39,800,000)

Contact: Jo Ann Macrina, Deputy Utility Director, 407.377.4341

- Project was CM @ Risk.
- Excellent experience with PC team.
- Project is currently on schedule despite hurricane and Covid-19 virus.
- Change Orders were reasonable, expected and some planned by City.
- City is also using PC Construction on another large project at City Water Plant.

Project: Hickory, NC NE WWTP Expansion (\$23,000,000 in 2012)

Contact: Shawn Pennell, Utility Director, 828.323.7500

- Excellent experience with PC team
- Finished 6 months ahead of schedule
- Basically, PC built a new plant "on top" of an existing plant without any service disruptions
- Very detail-oriented

Project: Frederick, MD WWTP Enhanced Nutrient Removal (\$44,000,000)

Contact: Stona Cosner, Superintendent of Wastewater Treatment, 301.600.1036

- Average to above average overall experience rating
- Change orders were reasonable and the superintendent made some very good field suggestions to improve the design
- Would welcome working with them again.

The following references were also called and voice messages left with a follow up emails but have not responded:

- Don Benjamin, Hanahan WWTP, Hanahan, SC (843.727.6876)
- Ruddy Mowe, Trap Rock WWTP, Leesburg, VA (571.291.7700)