



June 11, 2019

Attn: Mr. Don Chamblee, PE
Public Works Director
Lincoln County
115 W. Main Street
Lincolnton, NC 28092

**RE: Lincoln County, North Carolina
Highway 73, S. Ingleside Farm Rd, and Old Plank Rd. Water Line Extensions
WKD Project Number #20170324.00.HI
Bid Tabulation and Recommendation**

Dear Don:

Enclosed is the Certified Bid Tabulation for the subject project. The three lowest bidders, listed in ascending order, are English Construction Co., Inc., State Utility Contractors, Inc., and Garney Companies, Inc.

During our review of the five bids that were submitted for the project, we found the following errors:

- English Construction Co., Inc. made a \$13,440 error in the Subtotals for Division 1; Schedule A of \$800, Schedule C of \$12,000, and Schedule A, B, C and Contingency of \$640 for a total of \$13,440 more than their bid amount.
- Garney Companies Inc. for Division 1, Schedule B, reciprocated the unit prices for Line Items #9 and #10 and Schedule C unit prices were not extended; however, their totals for Division 1 matched up with the bid tabulation.
- Buckeye Bridge, LLC made an error of (-\$28,900) for the subtotal base bid of Division 1, Schedule A, B, C of (-\$28,900), plus an error of (-\$1,445) in Contingency, for a total amount of (-\$30,345) less than Buckeye's bid amount.
- Piedmont Utility Group, LLC made errors consisting of (-\$0.03) for Division 1, Schedule A, Line Item #2, (-\$0.05) for Line Item #6, and (-\$1.12) for Line Item #24. Resulting in errors of the Subtotal Division 1, Schedule A of (-\$1.21) and Division 1 Contingency of (-\$0.05) for a total amount of (-\$1.27) less than Piedmont's bid amount.

The Certified Bid Tabulation reflects the corrected numbers.

401 4th Street, SW
Suite 201
Hickory, NC 28601
Tel. 828.327.6911
www.wkdickson.com

Aviation • Water Resources • Community Development • Geomatics

Other comments based on our review of the bid documents received from the three lowest bidders are as follows:

- English Construction Co., Inc. and Garney Companies, Inc. included all of the Owner preferred alternate equipment items in their base bid.
- State Utility Contractors, Inc. included all but one of the Owner preferred alternate equipment items in their base bid. An additional cost of \$7,500 was provided for the use of chemical tanks provided by Poly Processing Company.
- There were no irregularities in the Statement of Qualifications submitted by State Utility Contractors, Inc. and Garney Companies, Inc. Both provided substantial evidence of their qualifications to perform the work of the project.
- English Construction Co., Inc., State Utility Contractors, Inc., and Garney Companies, Inc. provided the MWBE Affidavit A and identification of minority business participation in an amount greater than the 10% goal for work at the booster pumping station.
- English Construction Co., Inc. provided MWBE Affidavit C within 72 hours after notification of being the low bidder.

Since we are not familiar with the work of English Construction Co., Inc., we carefully reviewed the Statement of Qualifications provided as part of the bid package required by the Contract documents. The Statement of Qualifications required examples of similar experience, references, disclosure of incidents of failure to complete prior projects and any pending disputes, claims or litigation.

The majority of the current and similar projects provided in English Construction Co., Inc.'s Statement of Qualifications were plant projects located in Virginia. The company is headquartered in Lynchburg, VA. We focused our reference research to similar projects requiring significant piping components and located in North Carolina. Of the projects provided in the Statement of Qualifications only two met the minimum requirements of pipeline experience. One of these projects was for the Town of Strasburg, VA and the second was the Steele Creek Pump Station Replacement project for Charlotte Water. We contacted Jay Fulmer with Brown and Caldwell in regard to the Steele Creek Pump Station Replacement project for Charlotte Water. The feedback was that the quality of work was acceptable, however, the project is approximately 1 year behind schedule and that there were planning and coordination issues on behalf of English Construction Co., Inc. We contacted Matthew Shultz with HDR in regard to the Reedy Fork Wastewater Pumping Station for Winston-Salem / Forsyth County. This project did not meet the minimum requirements of pipeline experience, but it was the only other North Carolina project reference provided in the Statement of Qualifications. The feedback was that the quality of work was acceptable and there were no major issues.

English Construction Co., Inc. disclosed that they have failed to complete a construction contract and that there were pending claims against the firm. Details of these items were enclosed as attachments within the Statement of Qualifications and enclosed herein for your review. With regard to pending claims; the disclosed incidents appear to be minor. With regard to disclosure of failing to complete a construction contract; the disclosed incident involving the Stevens Creek Lift Station, Force Main, and Gravity Sewer project for Charlotte Water appears to reflect actual occurrences based on our conversations with others in the industry. We were unable to speak to someone with Charlotte Water specifically about the circumstances of this project. While researching this situation it was discovered that English Construction Co., Inc., did not disclose that they were terminated from a construction contract with Charlotte Water involving the Clems Branch Pump Station and Force Main Replacement project. Cited from Charlotte Water's project update web site, the update provided on May 1, 2019 stated that construction contract was terminated on the grounds of safety concerns. We contacted Charlotte Water's project manager, Matt Bedford, to discuss the circumstances of termination. Mr. Bedford declined to disclose details of the situation.

We spoke to Henry Myers, Vice President of English Construction Co., Inc. Mr. Myers explained that Mr. Dalton Walker and a core group of individuals, previously employed by DeVere Construction, Inc., were hired several years ago to increase English Construction Co., Inc.'s pipeline construction capabilities. It is our understanding that this group of individuals is operating out of the Charlotte area. Upon request, additional project references were provided demonstrating Mr. Walker's experience while employed at previous companies. Several of the references provided are no longer working with the employer of that time and were not contacted. From this list, the following references were contacted:

- Concord/Albemarle Water Main – DeVere Construction, Inc. - Christie Putnam, City of Concord and Kirk Gavel, Gavel and Dorn: Both references were contacted. The feedback indicated that the project fell behind schedule and that project was eventually completed by another construction company.
- Highway 64 12" DIP Water Main – Triangle Grading and Paving, Inc. - Bill Lester, LKC Engineering. Mr. Lester was employed by Hobbs Upchurch when this project was constructed. Mr. Lester stated that the project was completed approximately 15 years ago and that there were no major issues.

To further our understanding of English Construction Co. Inc.'s performance on plant projects we attempted to contact several additional references provided within Statement of Qualifications. We were able to speak to Edward Stempien with the City of Raleigh in regard to the EM Johnson WTP

Flocculation and Sedimentation Pilot project. This project was managed by individuals from English Construction Co., Inc.'s Lynchburg, VA office. The feedback was positive.

Based on the information we have received at this time, the plant and pump station projects implemented by English Construction Co., Inc. from their corporate office in Lynchburg, VA resulted in positive references. The pipeline projects recently implemented by English Construction Co., Inc. resulted in unfavorable references.

We believe that the bid received by English Construction Co., Inc. in the amount of \$7,733,147.10, is non-responsive in accordance with the Contract Documents, as a result of their failure to disclose a termination of a construction contract. Based on this determination, State Utility Construction, Inc. should be considered the lowest responsive, responsible bidder. State Utility Contractors, Inc. was the second low bidder for the project, providing a bid in the amount of \$7,796,782.20. This price includes an additional \$7,500 for providing the Owner preferred chemical tanks. Having knowledge of their experience with a project of this nature, review of their Statement of Qualifications, and their reputation throughout the industry, we feel confident that they are prepared and capable to perform the work.

Before proceeding we recommend that Lincoln County review the bid packages provided by English Construction Co., Inc. and State Utility Contractors, Inc. thoroughly for consideration of selection for this project. We recommend that Lincoln County consult with legal counsel to confirm our recommendation to reject the bid provided by English Construction Co., Inc.

We appreciate the opportunity to provide this service for Lincoln County, and we are available to answer any questions you may have.

Sincerely,

W. K. Dickson & Co., Inc.



Ryan W. Hager, P.E.
Project Manager

Enclosures

English Construction Co., Inc.'s disclosure of claims

English Construction Co., Inc.'s disclosure of failure to complete

1. English Construction Company, Inc. v. Kondakor Excavation, Inc.

- **Circumstances.** Kondakor was a subcontractor who failed to pay its second-tier subcontractor approximately \$6000.00. English sued Kondakor on behalf of the second-tier sub.
- **Resolution.** Kondakor and the second-tier subcontractor finally reached an agreement and the agreed upon amount was paid. English voluntarily dismissed the lawsuit.
- **Date of Original Suit/Resolution.** May 1, 2017/August 11, 2017.

2. English Construction Company, Inc. v. Tarheel Drilling & Blasting, Inc.

- **Circumstances.** Tarheel was a drilling and blasting subcontractor. Tarheel did not perform its job in accordance with the Project plans and specifications. Ultimately, Tarheel walked off the job. English was forced to hire a replacement subcontractor, which charged a much higher rate to perform the drilling and blasting work. English sued Tarheel to recover the additional cost of hiring the replacement subcontractor and for remedial work that had to be completed throughout the project on account of Tarheel's failure to perform.
- **Resolution.** The parties agreed to settle all disputes. A written settlement agreement has been signed by all parties.
- **Date of Original Suit/Resolution.** May 3, 2017/December 20, 2018.

Legal Action Implemented by Subcontractor

1. Devere Construction Company, Inc. v. English Construction Company, Inc.

- **Circumstances.** Devere Construction Company, Inc. ("Devere") was a prospective subcontractor of English Construction Company, Inc. ("English"). Devere was unable to furnish payment and performance bonds. Thus, Devere was removed from the job. Devere commenced a lawsuit against English, seeking to recover for partial work completed. English claimed it was entitled to an offset for the invoices it paid on behalf of Devere and delays caused by Devere.
- **Resolution.** Jury verdict in favor of English and an award in the amount of \$1.
- **Date of Original Suit/Resolution.** 2016/September 22, 2017.

Arbitrations

1. Pender v. English Construction Company, Inc.

- **Circumstances.** Pender's automobile was damaged when it hit a manhole in an island. Pender sued, alleging negligence on the part of English for failing to sufficiently mark the island area. The case went to arbitration.
- **Resolution.** The arbitrator ruled against Pender, finding that English was not negligent.

Failure to Complete – Applicant

1. Stevens Creek Lift Station, Force Main, and Gravity Sewer (Contract # 2019000199)

- **Owner.** Charlotte Water, Charlotte, NC
- **Summary.** Prior to receiving the Notice to Proceed, English Construction Company, Inc. ("English") informed the Owner of a contractual issue regarding the Owner's intended use of an Engineer different than the Engineer stated in the Contract Documents. English considered the substitution of Engineer's to be a change of a material term and opposed the substitution. English requested that the Owner retain the original Engineer or issue a Change Order, including an appropriate increase to the Contract Price. After meeting to discuss the concerns, the Owner decided to invoke its right to terminate the contract for convenience.

BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
HIGHWAY 73 WATER LINE
BID DATE: JUNE 4, 2019 @ 2:00 PM

				1	2	3	4	5					
				English Construction Co., Inc. 615 Church Street, Ste. 2 Lynchburg, VA 25404 License No. 8786	State Utility Contractors, Inc. 4417 Old Charlotte Highway Monroe, NC 28110 License No. 17793	Garney Companies, Inc. 505 James Jackson Ave. Cary, NC 27513 License No. 25801	Buckeye Bridge, LLC 654 Buckeye Cove Road Canton, NC 28716 License No. 72900	Piedmont Utility Group, LLC 681 NC 120 Highway Mooresboro, NC 28114 License No. 78068					
Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price
	Division 1, Schedule A-NC Highway 73 Water Line												
1	Mobilization	1	LS	182,000.00	\$ 182,000.00	180,000.00	\$ 180,000.00	125,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	90,000.00	\$ 90,000.00	195,645.14	\$ 195,645.14
2	8" dia. DIP Water Line	80	LF	79.00	\$ 6,320.00	85.00	\$ 6,800.00	50.00	\$ 4,000.00	63.80	\$ 5,104.00	69.00	\$ 5,520.00
3	16" dia. DIP Water Line	17590	LF	83.50	\$ 1,468,765.00	90.00	\$ 1,583,100.00	79.00	\$ 1,389,610.00	98.40	\$ 1,730,856.00	96.36	\$ 1,694,972.40
4	24" dia. DIP Water Line	262	LF	130.00	\$ 34,060.00	135.00	\$ 35,370.00	160.00	\$ 41,920.00	147.10	\$ 38,540.20	179.96	\$ 47,149.52
5	16" dia. Restrained Joint DIP Water Line	1510	LF	128.00	\$ 193,280.00	120.00	\$ 181,200.00	110.00	\$ 166,100.00	127.20	\$ 192,072.00	135.81	\$ 205,073.10
6	24" dia. Restrained Joint DIP Water Line	270	LF	204.00	\$ 55,080.00	185.00	\$ 49,950.00	153.00	\$ 41,310.00	200.00	\$ 54,000.00	191.17	\$ 51,615.90
7	8 MIL Polyethylene Encasement	40	LF	72.00	\$ 2,880.00	15.00	\$ 600.00	14.00	\$ 560.00	6.30	\$ 252.00	20.20	\$ 808.00
8	16" Dia. Steel Casing (t=0.250"), No Carrier Pipe, Jack & Bore	60	LF	645.00	\$ 38,700.00	905.00	\$ 54,300.00	1,200.00	\$ 72,000.00	1,166.00	\$ 69,960.00	1,583.33	\$ 94,999.80
9	24" Dia. Steel Casing (t=0.344"), No Carrier Pipe, Jack & Bore	215	LF	740.00	\$ 159,100.00	1,000.00	\$ 215,000.00	1,500.00	\$ 322,500.00	1,199.00	\$ 257,785.00	1,583.33	\$ 340,415.95
10	36" Dia. Steel Casing (t=0.406"), No Carrier Pipe, Jack & Bore	40	LF	880.00	\$ 35,200.00	1,100.00	\$ 44,000.00	2,000.00	\$ 80,000.00	1,271.00	\$ 50,840.00	1,583.33	\$ 63,333.20
11	8" Gate Valve	1	EA	1,590.00	\$ 1,590.00	1,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	3,000.00	\$ 3,000.00	1,760.00	\$ 1,760.00	1,600.22	\$ 1,600.22
12	12" Gate Valve	1	EA	2,760.00	\$ 2,760.00	2,600.00	\$ 2,600.00	4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	3,047.00	\$ 3,047.00	3,021.50	\$ 3,021.50
13	16" Gate Valve	20	EA	10,270.00	\$ 205,400.00	9,500.00	\$ 190,000.00	10,000.00	\$ 200,000.00	8,600.00	\$ 172,000.00	8,803.73	\$ 176,074.60
14	2" Dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 2 and 5' Dia. Manhole	7	EA	9,600.00	\$ 67,200.00	14,500.00	\$ 101,500.00	8,000.00	\$ 56,000.00	12,470.00	\$ 87,290.00	13,678.87	\$ 95,752.09
15	3" Dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 3 and 5' Dia. Manhole	4	EA	10,500.00	\$ 42,000.00	15,500.00	\$ 62,000.00	11,000.00	\$ 44,000.00	12,785.00	\$ 51,140.00	14,900.21	\$ 59,600.84
16	2" Blow-Off Assembly	2	EA	4,680.00	\$ 9,360.00	2,500.00	\$ 5,000.00	6,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	10,293.00	\$ 20,586.00	3,869.92	\$ 7,739.84
17	Connection to Existing 16" Water Line	1	EA	5,500.00	\$ 5,500.00	3,500.00	\$ 3,500.00	4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	2,731.00	\$ 2,731.00	6,079.61	\$ 6,079.61
18	Connection to Existing 24" Water Line	1	EA	6,600.00	\$ 6,600.00	5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	3,950.00	\$ 3,950.00	7,912.28	\$ 7,912.28
19	Fire Hydrant Assembly	20	EA	6,500.00	\$ 130,000.00	6,000.00	\$ 120,000.00	6,000.00	\$ 120,000.00	6,098.00	\$ 121,960.00	5,580.26	\$ 111,605.20
20	Stream Crossings - Open Cut	50	LF	660.00	\$ 33,000.00	1,700.00	\$ 85,000.00	1,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	2,170.00	\$ 108,500.00	834.32	\$ 41,716.00
21	Gravel/Dirt Road, Driveway, Walkway, & Parking Repair (8' Width)	304	LF	36.00	\$ 10,944.00	26.00	\$ 7,904.00	80.00	\$ 24,320.00	22.90	\$ 6,961.60	27.50	\$ 8,360.00
22	Concrete Driveway Repair (8' Width)	36	SY	142.00	\$ 5,112.00	150.00	\$ 5,400.00	170.00	\$ 6,120.00	113.50	\$ 4,086.00	149.73	\$ 5,390.28
23	Asphalt Driveway & Parking Repair (8' Width)	205	LF	71.00	\$ 14,555.00	70.00	\$ 14,350.00	100.00	\$ 20,500.00	55.30	\$ 11,336.50	72.21	\$ 14,803.05
24	Asphalt Non-NCDOT Road Repair	56	SY	78.00	\$ 4,368.00	150.00	\$ 8,400.00	200.00	\$ 11,200.00	154.00	\$ 8,624.00	135.37	\$ 7,580.72
25	New Short-Side Residential Service Connection	34	EA	2,127.00	\$ 72,318.00	1,900.00	\$ 64,600.00	2,000.00	\$ 68,000.00	2,604.00	\$ 88,536.00	2,631.81	\$ 89,481.54
26	New Long-Side Residential Service Connection	37	EA	3,190.00	\$ 118,030.00	3,600.00	\$ 133,200.00	2,500.00	\$ 92,500.00	3,269.00	\$ 120,953.00	4,488.91	\$ 166,089.67
27	Residential Service Connection After Main Line Installation (Additive cost to Line Items 25 and 26)	35	EA	225.00	\$ 7,875.00	300.00	\$ 10,500.00	1,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	263.10	\$ 9,208.50	880.00	\$ 30,800.00
28	Foundation Stone	290	CY	92.00	\$ 26,680.00	55.00	\$ 15,950.00	70.00	\$ 20,300.00	81.30	\$ 23,577.00	38.00	\$ 11,020.00
29	Rock Excavation	2200	CY	86.00	\$ 189,200.00	65.00	\$ 143,000.00	100.00	\$ 220,000.00	60.00	\$ 132,000.00	63.00	\$ 138,600.00
30	Clearing	1	LS	109,000.00	\$ 109,000.00	90,000.00	\$ 90,000.00	150,000.00	\$ 150,000.00	105,258.00	\$ 105,258.00	95,780.00	\$ 95,780.00
31	Erosion Control	1	LS	125,800.00	\$ 125,800.00	117,000.00	\$ 117,000.00	79,000.00	\$ 79,000.00	23,363.00	\$ 23,363.00	16,172.75	\$ 16,172.75
32	Traffic Control	1	LS	91,000.00	\$ 91,000.00	32,000.00	\$ 32,000.00	3,600.00	\$ 3,600.00	8,658.00	\$ 8,658.00	52,800.00	\$ 52,800.00
33	Restoration, Seeding, and Mulching	1	LS	88,000.00	\$ 88,000.00	28,000.00	\$ 28,000.00	52,000.00	\$ 52,000.00	65,873.00	\$ 65,873.00	22,247.28	\$ 22,247.28
34	Final Inspection, Testing, Cleanup and Closeout	1	LS	81,000.00	\$ 81,000.00	22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	51,820.00	\$ 51,820.00	41,800.00	\$ 41,800.00
	Subtotal: Division 1, Schedule A-NC Highway 73 Water Line, Bid Items 1 Through 34:				\$ 3,622,677.00		\$ 3,618,724.00		\$ 3,543,540.00		\$ 3,722,627.80		\$ 3,911,560.48

BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
HIGHWAY 73 WATER LINE
BID DATE: JUNE 4, 2019 @ 2:00 PM

				1		2		3		4		5	
				English Construction Co., Inc. 615 Church Street, Ste. 2 Lynchburg, VA 25404 License No. 8786		State Utility Contractors, Inc. 4417 Old Charlotte Highway Monroe, NC 28110 License No. 17793		Garney Companies, Inc. 505 James Jackson Ave. Cary, NC 27513 License No. 25801		Buckeye Bridge, LLC 654 Buckeye Cove Road Canton, NC 28716 License No. 72900		Piedmont Utility Group, LLC 681 NC 120 Highway Mooresboro, NC 28114 License No. 78068	
Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price
	Division 1, Schedule B-South Ingleside Farm Road Water Line												
1	Mobilization	1	LS	48,000.00	\$ 48,000.00	49,000.00	\$ 49,000.00	50,000.00	\$ 50,000.00	52,450.00	\$ 52,450.00	46,381.44	\$ 46,381.44
2	12" dia. DIP Water Line	5,886	LF	65.00	\$ 382,590.00	77.00	\$ 453,222.00	65.00	\$ 382,590.00	78.30	\$ 460,873.80	83.27	\$ 490,127.22
3	12" dia. Restrained Joint DIP Water Line	592	LF	87.00	\$ 51,504.00	95.00	\$ 56,240.00	77.00	\$ 45,584.00	94.40	\$ 55,884.80	105.73	\$ 62,592.16
4	12" Gate Valve	7	EA	3,160.00	\$ 22,120.00	2,600.00	\$ 18,200.00	3,000.00	\$ 21,000.00	3,056.00	\$ 21,392.00	3,021.50	\$ 21,150.50
5	2" dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 1 and 5" dia. Manhole	1	EA	8,340.00	\$ 8,340.00	13,500.00	\$ 13,500.00	10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	12,353.00	\$ 12,353.00	12,602.64	\$ 12,602.64
6	2" dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 2 and 5" dia. Manhole	3	EA	8,900.00	\$ 26,700.00	14,000.00	\$ 42,000.00	11,000.00	\$ 33,000.00	12,373.00	\$ 37,119.00	13,220.89	\$ 39,662.67
7	2" Blow-Off Assembly	1	EA	5,750.00	\$ 5,750.00	2,500.00	\$ 2,500.00	6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	1,218.00	\$ 1,218.00	4,221.52	\$ 4,221.52
8	Connection to Existing 12" Water Line	1	EA	4,620.00	\$ 4,620.00	2,500.00	\$ 2,500.00	4,000.00	\$ 4,000.00	2,536.00	\$ 2,536.00	5,421.18	\$ 5,421.18
9	Fire Hydrant Assembly	7	EA	5,385.00	\$ 37,695.00	4,700.00	\$ 32,900.00	5,000.00	\$ 35,000.00	6,453.00	\$ 45,171.00	4,840.08	\$ 33,880.56
10	Stream Crossings - Open Cut	50	LF	530.00	\$ 26,500.00	1,700.00	\$ 85,000.00	280.00	\$ 14,000.00	2,170.00	\$ 108,500.00	834.32	\$ 41,716.00
11	Gravel/Dirt Road, Driveway, Walkway, & Parking Repair (8' Width)	91	LF	36.00	\$ 3,276.00	26.00	\$ 2,366.00	25.00	\$ 2,275.00	22.90	\$ 2,083.90	27.50	\$ 2,502.50
12	Concrete Driveway Repair (8' Width)	87	SY	142.00	\$ 12,354.00	150.00	\$ 13,050.00	140.00	\$ 12,180.00	113.50	\$ 9,874.50	149.73	\$ 13,026.51
13	Asphalt Driveway & Parking Repair (8' Width)	25	LF	70.00	\$ 1,750.00	70.00	\$ 1,750.00	120.00	\$ 3,000.00	55.30	\$ 1,382.50	72.21	\$ 1,805.25
14	New Short-Side Residential Service Connection	13	EA	1,620.00	\$ 21,060.00	1,450.00	\$ 18,850.00	1,900.00	\$ 24,700.00	2,086.00	\$ 27,118.00	2,126.96	\$ 27,650.48
15	New Long-Side Residential Service Connection	10	EA	2,650.00	\$ 26,500.00	2,150.00	\$ 21,500.00	2,400.00	\$ 24,000.00	2,638.00	\$ 26,380.00	3,898.05	\$ 38,980.50
16	Residential Service Connection After Main Line Installation (Additive cost to Line Items 14 and 15)	12	EA	225.00	\$ 2,700.00	300.00	\$ 3,600.00	1,000.00	\$ 12,000.00	263.00	\$ 3,156.00	880.00	\$ 10,560.00
17	Foundation Stone	60	CY	92.00	\$ 5,520.00	55.00	\$ 3,300.00	80.00	\$ 4,800.00	81.30	\$ 4,878.00	38.00	\$ 2,280.00
18	Rock Excavation	800	CY	103.00	\$ 82,400.00	65.00	\$ 52,000.00	93.00	\$ 74,400.00	60.00	\$ 48,000.00	0.01	\$ 8.00
19	Clearing	1	LS	76,900.00	\$ 76,900.00	55,000.00	\$ 55,000.00	65,000.00	\$ 65,000.00	66,017.00	\$ 66,017.00	63,380.00	\$ 63,380.00
20	Erosion Control	1	LS	54,220.00	\$ 54,220.00	33,000.00	\$ 33,000.00	24,000.00	\$ 24,000.00	13,938.00	\$ 13,938.00	4,103.00	\$ 4,103.00
21	Traffic Control	1	LS	62,000.00	\$ 62,000.00	22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	33,000.00	\$ 33,000.00	8,658.00	\$ 8,658.00	17,600.00	\$ 17,600.00
22	Restoration, Seeding, and Mulching	1	LS	52,000.00	\$ 52,000.00	7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	17,000.00	\$ 17,000.00	22,968.00	\$ 22,968.00	10,300.40	\$ 10,300.40
23	Final Inspection, Testing, Cleanup and Closeout	1	LS	22,000.00	\$ 22,000.00	7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	5,000.00	\$ 5,000.00	17,909.00	\$ 17,909.00	26,400.00	\$ 26,400.00
	Subtotal: Division 1, Schedule B-South Ingleside Farm Road Water Line Bid Items, 1 Through 23:				\$ 1,036,499.00		\$ 996,478.00		\$ 902,529.00		\$ 1,049,860.50		\$ 976,352.53

BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
HIGHWAY 73 WATER LINE
BID DATE: JUNE 4, 2019 @ 2:00 PM

				1	2	3	4	5					
				English Construction Co., Inc. 615 Church Street, Ste. 2 Lynchburg, VA 25404 License No. 8786	State Utility Contractors, Inc. 4417 Old Charlotte Highway Monroe, NC 28110 License No. 17793	Garney Companies, Inc. 505 James Jackson Ave. Cary, NC 27513 License No. 25801	Buckeye Bridge, LLC 654 Buckeye Cove Road Canton, NC 28716 License No. 72900	Piedmont Utility Group, LLC 681 NC 120 Highway Mooresboro, NC 28114 License No. 78068					
Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price
	Division 1, Schedule C-Old Plank Road Water Line												
1	Mobilization	1	LS	37,880.00	\$ 37,880.00	34,000.00	\$ 34,000.00	25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	42,100.00	\$ 42,100.00	41,284.04	\$ 41,284.04
2	12" dia. DIP Water Line	5,769	LF	65.00	\$ 374,985.00	56.00	\$ 323,064.00	73.00	\$ 421,137.00	80.10	\$ 462,096.90	81.52	\$ 470,288.88
3	12" dia. Restrained Joint DIP Water Line	148	LF	99.00	\$ 14,652.00	85.00	\$ 12,580.00	100.00	\$ 14,800.00	96.20	\$ 14,237.60	123.07	\$ 18,214.36
4	20" Dia. Steel Casing (t=0.281"), No Carrier Pipe, Jack & Bore	30	LF	1,150.00	\$ 34,500.00	920.00	\$ 27,600.00	2,400.00	\$ 72,000.00	1,172.00	\$ 35,160.00	1,583.33	\$ 47,499.90
5	12" Gate Valve	6	EA	3,390.00	\$ 20,340.00	2,600.00	\$ 15,600.00	3,100.00	\$ 18,600.00	3,056.00	\$ 18,336.00	3,021.50	\$ 18,129.00
6	2" dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 1 and 5" dia. Manhole	1	EA	8,800.00	\$ 8,800.00	13,500.00	\$ 13,500.00	10,000.00	\$ 10,000.00	12,353.00	\$ 12,353.00	12,492.64	\$ 12,492.64
7	2" dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 2 and 5" dia. Manhole	3	EA	9,360.00	\$ 28,080.00	14,000.00	\$ 42,000.00	10,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	12,373.00	\$ 37,119.00	13,110.90	\$ 39,332.70
8	Connection to Existing 12" Water Line	1	EA	5,540.00	\$ 5,540.00	2,500.00	\$ 2,500.00	3,400.00	\$ 3,400.00	2,536.00	\$ 2,536.00	5,091.18	\$ 5,091.18
9	Fire Hydrant Assembly	5	EA	5,400.00	\$ 27,000.00	4,700.00	\$ 23,500.00	6,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	5,461.00	\$ 27,305.00	4,873.02	\$ 24,365.10
10	Gravel/Dirt Road, Driveway, Walkway, & Parking Repair (8' Width)	143	LF	36.00	\$ 5,148.00	26.00	\$ 3,718.00	18.00	\$ 2,574.00	22.90	\$ 3,274.70	27.50	\$ 3,932.50
11	Concrete Driveway Repair (8' Width)	33	SY	142.00	\$ 4,686.00	150.00	\$ 4,950.00	165.00	\$ 5,445.00	113.50	\$ 3,745.50	149.73	\$ 4,941.09
12	Asphalt Driveway & Parking Repair (8' Width)	20	LF	70.00	\$ 1,400.00	70.00	\$ 1,400.00	134.00	\$ 2,680.00	55.30	\$ 1,106.00	72.21	\$ 1,444.20
13	New Short-Side Residential Service Connection	8	EA	1,620.00	\$ 12,960.00	1,450.00	\$ 11,600.00	2,000.00	\$ 16,000.00	2,064.00	\$ 16,512.00	2,019.99	\$ 16,159.92
14	New Long-Side Residential Service Connection	11	EA	2,650.00	\$ 29,150.00	2,150.00	\$ 23,650.00	2,500.00	\$ 27,500.00	2,728.00	\$ 30,008.00	3,873.46	\$ 42,608.06
15	Residential Service Connection After Main Line Installation (Additive cost to Line Items 13 and 14)	9	EA	225.00	\$ 2,025.00	300.00	\$ 2,700.00	1,000.00	\$ 9,000.00	263.00	\$ 2,367.00	880.00	\$ 7,920.00
16	Foundation Stone	60	CY	92.00	\$ 5,520.00	55.00	\$ 3,300.00	77.00	\$ 4,620.00	81.00	\$ 4,860.00	38.00	\$ 2,280.00
17	Rock Excavation	700	CY	103.00	\$ 72,100.00	65.00	\$ 45,500.00	82.00	\$ 57,400.00	60.00	\$ 42,000.00	0.01	\$ 7.00
18	Clearing	1	LS	65,000.00	\$ 65,000.00	42,000.00	\$ 42,000.00	25,000.00	\$ 25,000.00	50,944.00	\$ 50,944.00	51,500.00	\$ 51,500.00
19	Erosion Control	1	LS	38,960.00	\$ 38,960.00	30,000.00	\$ 30,000.00	21,000.00	\$ 21,000.00	8,261.00	\$ 8,261.00	5,731.00	\$ 5,731.00
20	Traffic Control	1	LS	57,000.00	\$ 57,000.00	16,000.00	\$ 16,000.00	37,800.00	\$ 37,800.00	21,435.00	\$ 21,435.00	14,960.00	\$ 14,960.00
21	Restoration, Seeding, and Mulching	1	LS	48,000.00	\$ 48,000.00	7,000.00	\$ 7,000.00	16,000.00	\$ 16,000.00	15,850.00	\$ 15,850.00	6,485.60	\$ 6,485.60
22	Final Inspection, Testing, Cleanup and Closeout	1	LS	20,000.00	\$ 20,000.00	7,000.00	\$ 7,000.00	6,000.00	\$ 6,000.00	16,800.00	\$ 16,800.00	24,200.00	\$ 24,200.00
	Subtotal: Division 1, Schedule C-Old Plank Road Water Line, Bid Items, 1 Through 22:				\$ 913,726.00		\$ 693,162.00		\$ 855,956.00		\$ 868,406.70		\$ 858,867.17
Subtotal Division 1, Schedules A, B and C:					\$ 5,572,902.00		\$ 5,308,364.00		\$ 5,302,025.00		\$ 5,640,895.00		\$ 5,746,780.18

BID TABULATION
LINCOLN COUNTY, NC
HIGHWAY 73 WATER LINE
BID DATE: JUNE 4, 2019 @ 2:00 PM

				1		2		3		4		5	
				English Construction Co., Inc. 615 Church Street, Ste. 2 Lynchburg, VA 25404 License No. 8786		State Utility Contractors, Inc. 4417 Old Charlotte Highway Monroe, NC 28110 License No. 17793		Garney Companies, Inc. 505 James Jackson Ave. Cary, NC 27513 License No. 25801		Buckeye Bridge, LLC 654 Buckeye Cove Road Canton, NC 28716 License No. 72900		Piedmont Utility Group, LLC 681 NC 120 Highway Mooresboro, NC 28114 License No. 78068	
Item	Item Description	Quantity	Unit	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price	Unit Price	Total Bid Price
Division 2, Booster Pump Station Lump Sum Bid Price													
1	Booster Pump Station	1	LS	1,792,000.00	\$ 1,792,000.00	2,110,000.00	\$ 2,110,000.00	2,200,000.00	\$ 2,200,000.00	2,250,341.00	\$ 2,250,341.00	2,371,600.00	\$ 2,371,600.00
Subtotal Base Bid, Division 1 - Schedules A, B and C and Division 2:					\$ 7,364,902.00		\$ 7,418,364.00		\$ 7,502,025.00		\$ 7,891,236.00		\$ 8,118,380.18
Contingency Allowance @ 5%:					\$ 368,245.10		\$ 370,918.20		\$ 375,101.25		\$ 394,561.80		\$ 405,919.01
Total Base Bid, Division 1 - Schedules A, B, C, Division 2, and Contingency:					\$ 7,733,147.10		\$ 7,789,282.20		\$ 7,877,126.25		\$ 8,285,797.80		\$ 8,524,299.19
Spec	Division 1, Schedule D-Tabulation of Preferred Equipment Items and Products												
33 11 00	2" Dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 1	2	EA	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	-371.00	\$ (742.00)	0.00	\$ -
33 11 00	2" dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 2 and 5" dia. Manhole	13	EA	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	257.00	\$ 3,341.00	0.00	\$ -
33 11 00	D" Dual Combination Air Release Valve Type 3	4	EA	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	266.00	\$ 1,064.00	0.00	\$ -
Subtotal: Division 1, Schedule D-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products (Addition/Deduct)					\$ -		\$ -		\$ -		\$ 3,663.00		\$ -
Spec	Division 2, Schedule D-Tabulation of Preferred Equipment Items and Products												
40 91 13.16	Residual Chlorine Measurement & Instrumentation	1	LS	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -
40 94 00	Pressure Reducing Valve w/Solenoid Shutoff	1	LS	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -
44 42 73	Polyethylene Chemical Storage Tanks	1	LS	0.00	\$ -	7,500.00	\$ 7,500.00	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -
26 45 00	Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition (SCADA)	1	LS	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -	0.00	\$ -
Subtotal: Division 2, Schedule D-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products (Addition/Deduct)					\$ -		\$ 7,500.00		\$ -		\$ -		\$ -
Total Bid: Division 1, Schedule A,B,C,D and Division 2, Booster Pump Station, Contingency and Schedule D-Tabulation of Major Equipment Items and Products					\$ 7,733,147.10		\$ 7,796,782.20		\$ 7,877,126.25		\$ 8,289,460.80		\$ 8,524,299.19

To the best of my knowledge, I hereby certify that the above is a true and correct tabulation of bids received on June 4, 2019.

Ryan W. Hager, PE
Project Manager
W.K. Dickson & Co., Inc.
NC-License F-0374



Div. 1, Sched A, Subtotal
calc error \$800
Div. 1, Sched C, Subtotal
calc error \$12,000
Div. 1, S ched A,B,C
Subtotal total calc error
\$12,800
Contingency calc error
\$640
Calc error of
\$13,440 more than bid

Div. 1, Sched B, Line
Items 9 and 10 unit prices
were reciprocated.
The extended totals are
correct.
Garney did not extend
unit price totals for Div. 1,
Schedule C; however,
total for said Schedule
matched w/bid tab

Div. 1, Sched A, B, C
Subtotal Base Bid
calc error of (-\$28,900);
plus contingency error
of (-\$1,445) for total
calc error in Buckeye's
favor of (-\$30,345)
for Div. 1, Sched A,B,C
Total Base Bid

Div. 1, Sched. A, various
calc errors;
Line Item 2, (-\$0.03)
Line Item 6, (-\$0.05)
Line Item 24, (-\$1.12)
Sub Div. 1, Sched A
(-\$1.21)
Sub . Div. 1, Sched A,B,C
Contingency (-\$0.05)
Total calc error in
Piemont's favor of (-\$1.27)